



## Shaikh al-Albani's Debate with a Jihadi

The discussion starts with al-Jihad supporter:-

Al-jihad supporter: We have no doubt that you are one of the first of the scholars in the century to call for the return to the understanding of the Salaf. There is no doubt that the issue of jihad is an issue of disagreement among those who follow manhaj as-Salaf assalih. In the issue of jihad, we call the people to fight jihad under two conditions: The first is that it has to be done in pure intention for the sake of Allah. The second that it has to be under the banner of Islam. However we hear from the devout muslim youth other conditions that they narrate from you which we never heard about in hadith, such conditions are Islamic knowledge (or Education and purification - Tasfiyah wa Tarbiyah) and having Khilafa or an Islamic state. These conditions we hear a lot from the brothers who follow manhaj as-Salaf, and I am among those who follow this manhaj insha' Allah. My Question is: do these conditions have any reference in the Sunnah? or are they only an ijтиhad regarding the current situation and\or conditions? and before that do you really call for these conditions?

Al-Albani: first of all, we agreed to discuss this issue with you to find out about your Dawah.

Al-jihad supporter: I told you about it.

Al-Albani: Then, explain your Dawah. Your questions are premature now, I want to understand what you Dawah is for.

Al-jihad supporter: my Dawah is clear, to do jihad according to the conditions I mentioned. Intention because the Prophet ﷺ said "whoever fought for the word of Allah to be the higher word is fi sabeel Allah". Under the banner of Islam because the Prophet ﷺ

said "whoever fought for the sake of 3asabiyah supporting one group or fighting another and died, he died the death of jahiliyah."

Al-Albani: OK. Do we need an Amir to do jihad ?

Al-jihad supporter: No.

Al-Albani: so we do jihad in a big disorganized mess? (Arabic : Fawda)

Al-jihad supporter: No ... but

Al-Albani: Also, your first condition which is the pure intention. This condition in every worship so we are done with it. Your second, under the Islamic banner, do you imagine jihad without an Amir? how can we have an Islamic banner without an Amir for that banner ?

Al-jihad supporter: We can do jihad in this manner like if a Muslim goes to a kafir enemy leader, and kills him.

Al-Albani: But we were talking about the jihad of a group. Jihad under an Islamic banner is it the jihad of one person or the jihad of a group? Also, a group of Muslims that leave for jihad, do they not need an Amir to lead them?

Al-jihad supporter: Yes, yes of course. A group of Muslims who travel or leave for jihad need an Amir. And if a group of Muslims of more than 3 leave for Jihad they need an Amir.

Al-Albani: Then why did you not mention this as a condition?

Al-jihad supporter: well, okay, let us make it a third condition.

Al-Albani: Okay for the Fard Aayn jihad, do we need a jama3a for it or can it be done as individuals?

Al-jihad supporter: Either case.

Al-Albani: This is not an answer.

Al-jihad supporter: why is that?

Al-Albani: We said that jihad is two kinds: Fard Kifayah, which only a small group of Muslims can do, and if a group do it, the rest of the Muslims are not questioned about it. This kind of jihad individuals can do on their own. Fard Aayn which ALL the Muslims have to do it in a specific area. To do this kind of jihad, do we not need an Amir to lead the Muslims?

Al-jihad supporter: yes we need an Amir for this group if it fights or if it doesn't fight.

Al-Albani: Good Good, we return to say Amir to mean a Khalifa of the Muslims.

Al-jihad supporter: no not a khalifa.

Al-Albani: Why? Is it dangerous to say khalifa?

Al-jihad supporter: Yes of course, because this means we want to reap the fruit before we plant the trees.

Al-Albani: This is what I see you doing. You say you want an Amir for the whole group of Muslims to lead jihad and at the same time you don't want him to be the khalifa! Is this what you want?

Al-jihad supporter: well, yes.

Al-Albani: !! Okay then where is this Amir? and who is this Amir? and can we have more than one Amir? We are now on the condition we agreed on before, which is that we need an Amir, and you claim that we need an Amir to lead this group jihad without him being the khalifa. Which do we get first, the Amir or the jihad? This is like asking do we pray before the athan or after. which comes first ?

[After a while of arguing around]

Al-jihad supporter: Okay we do need an Amir for the Fard Aayn jihad before we start the jihad.

Al-Albani: Excellent. Then do we call to have an Amir first, or do we call for the jihad first.

Al-jihad supporter: well, both at the same time.

Al-Albani: la hawla wa la quwaata illa billah. We just agreed that we need an Amir for Jihad al-3ayn before we start the jihad. The next question is do we call for an Amir First or do we call for the jihad first? This group, all kinds of groups need an Amir. To call for this kind of jihad we do need an Amir first, the Amir will call for the mujahideen and send those here and those there.

Al-jihad supporter: okay what if a group of Muslims read in the Quran about jihad and want to do jihad, so they gather for jihad and then appoint an Amir on them.

Al-Albani: Ya akhi what you are describing is a case of jihad Fard al-Kifayah. For Fard Al-Kifayah it is okay for a small group to gather and go do jihad. For Fard al-Aayn we need the whole group of Muslims. How can we have to the whole group of Muslims if we don't have a unified leadership for this kind of jihad? This kind of Amir, I do not see any of the Mujahideen calling for it. Why do you not call for that Amir?

Al-jihad supporter: Okay then let us call for this Amir.

Al-Albani: OK, then what are the characters for this Amir, in your opinion?

Al-jihad supporter: [some characters]

Al-Albani: and do you see an Amir with these qualities?

Al-jihad supporter: yes, many.

Al-Albani: where?

Al-jihad supporter: everywhere.

Al-Albani: We said that we need an Amir for the whole group, ie for all the Muslims. How can we have more than one Amir for all the Muslims?

Al-jihad supporter: ... [arguing around]

Al-Albani: do you know what does the hadith of Huthayfah bin yaman (fa in lam yakun lahom jama'a wa la imam) say about this, does it lead to the

conclusion that this jihad needs a khalifa, or otherwise ?

[hadith narrated in bukhari , Kitab al-manaqib, hadith #3338 hadith says When people were asking the Prophet ﷺ about the goodness, i was asking about the evil in fear that it may get to me, so I asked "oh Prophet of Allah ﷺ we were in jahiliyah then Allah brought this goodness, will there be any evil after it?" the Prophet ﷺ said "yes there will", I said "will there be goodness after it?" he said "yes and it has some impurities" i asked "and what are its impurities?" he ﷺ said "people who guide without my guidance, you know of them and deny." I asked "is there evil after this goodness?" he said "yes, there will be preachers who preach for the doors of hellfire, whoever answers them they throw him into hellfire" so i said "oh Prophet of Allah ﷺ, describe them for us" he ﷺ said "they are from u and they speak from our language." so I asked "what should I do if i witness that?" the Prophet ﷺ said "stick with the group of Muslims and their leader" i asked "what if they had no leader?" he said "if they had no leader or imam, then leave all these groups even if you had to bite on a tree until your death."]

Al-jihad supporter: what does this Hadith have to do with our discussion?

Al-Albani: did Huthayfah not ask the Prophet ﷺ about what to do when there are callers to the doors of hellfire? The Prophet ﷺ answered that he must stick to the imam of the jama'a, if there is no imam then let him stay away from every jama'a. Do these conditions apply to today? Do we not have people who claim to be Muslims yet they are callers to hellfire? Is Khilafa not missing?

Al-jihad supporter: I prefer to discuss other Ahadith, like "there is still a portion of my nation fighting for the right, they do not care whoever disagreed with them or let them down."

Al-Albani: What does this have to do with our discussion? We are not in disagreement about calling for jihad. We are in agreement that jihad is an obligation (Fard Aayn) today, what we disagree on is that do we need a

khalifa first or not. What you quoted adds nothing to the argument. We both agree that jihad is a Fard. Do you understand? What we disagree about is the issue of needing a khalifa to start this jihad.

Al-jihad supporter: OK.

Al-Albani: notice that the Prophet ﷺ advised Huthayfah to stick with the imam of the Muslims and their main group. You have that all the conditions in that Hadith are true today...

Al-jihad supporter: true...

Al-Albani: and the Prophet ﷺ said if the Muslims had no imam or jama'a, to leave all the groups. So what do you do now?

Al-jihad supporter: well, we try to look for the group of Muslims and find an imam for it.

Al-Albani: this is what we call for! Jihad is fard, but right now is not the time for it. We need the imam first and that the Prophet ﷺ ordered you to follow and stick with his group.

Al-jihad supporter: How do we know that we cannot do jihad until we get this khalifa that is indeed necessary?

Al-Albani: the Hadith says if the Muslims had no one leader then leave all the groups. And we already said before that the jihad for Fard al-Aayn has to be done the jama'a led by a leader to all the Muslims, an Amir. If the Muslims had no leader they stay away from ALL groups. How can they do group jihad if they should at the same time stay away from all groups??? you are contradicting what you already agreed on. Islamically we have only one banner, one group and one leader. We do need this one group to start the Fard al-Aayn jihad.

Al-jihad supporter: ...

Al-Albani: now what I want to do is prove to you that this Amir of the Fard Aayn jihad must be a khalifa, not just an Amir. The dallel is the Hadith of

Huthayfah again. Sometimes as you know the evidence is clear and sometimes not very, (qat'i al-dilalah, or thahiri al-dilalah). Let us consider an example of a Shaikh advising his student on the guidelines of this Hadith. The student asks his Shaikh what to do to avoid the evil, the Shaikh says stick with the imam of the Muslims. The student answers that the Muslims have no khalifa, so the Shaikh advises him to stay away from all the groups. This student is obedient to his Shaikh and this Shaikh that is following his Prophet (صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ). What would this student do? He would go ahead living his life in a valley looking after his sheep or whatever, worshiping Allah. Where is jihad? If it was a wajib on this muslim to fight then the Shaikh would tell him to fight, and not to stay away from every group. Is there a jihad here? As long as there is no imam then there is no jihad. This evidence is Qat3i al-Dilalah. Jihaad must be in the supervision of an Imam, or khalifa. But let me tell you about something that troubles many of the students of knowledge, that there are many groups that fight like the afghan or those in Syria a decade or more ago. Those people, if they want to fight they must be under the leadership of one Amir, that doesn't mean that Syrians fight in Afghanistan and Afghanis in Syria, no. It means that both fighting groups must be under the supervision on one Imam and one khalifa. If there was no one imam and no one jama3a (not in the meaning of two fighting groups, but in the meaning of one group in their unity of leadership, but could be more than one group of fighters each fighting in a part of the Islamic world), both groups would be operating on their own.

To do this Fard Aayn jihad, the wajib of the Muslims is unity, the unity needs a khalifa. To establish this thing we must start with education and purification (Tasfiyah wa Tarbiyah). We cannot start with jihad right now.

You say that there are many groups for jihad, yet all these groups are in disagreement and as Allah said in Quran "wa la tanaza'o fa tafshalu wa thahaba ree'okum". We are today many like the flowing of the river, what you want to do is give legitimacy to these ghutha' groups.

Al-jihad supporter: okay then how does this education and purification (Tasfiyah wa Tarbiyah) lead to khilafa?

Al-Albani: History repeats itself. Everybody claims that the Prophet (صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ) is their role model. Our Prophet (صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ) spent the first half of his message in making Dawah, and he started with it not with jihad. The Prophet (صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ) first raised his companions Islamic education like he educated them to say the word of truth and not be afraid of it, he also taught them the Islamic teachings. We know that our Islam today is not like it was when Allah revealed "today I have completed your religion", many things have indeed been added to Islam, do you not agree?

Al-jihad supporter: Yes I fully agree. But there are many Quranic proofs that jihad is an important obligation!

Al-Albani: I do not deny that, but ya akhi the question is "where do we start from?" My Dawah is : to do this jihad we need an Amir, to get this Amir we must work on the Tasfiyah and Tarbiyah. Think about this on your own, by considering the hadith of Huthayfah which do we need first jihad or the Amir?

Al-jihad supporter: has anyone before called for Tasfiyah and Tarbiyah before jihad?

Al-Albani: May Allah be merciful with you. Tell me when did the Muslims not have a unified khalifa?

Al-jihad supporter: What about the time of Ali and Mu3awiyah?

Al-Albani: You mean you have a doubt that Ali was right, and that Mu3awiyah was wrong?

Al-jihad supporter: No ... but

Al-Albani: no "but"s. How many khulafa' were there?

[After a while of discussion]

Al-jihad supporter: OK, OK, one.

A listener: To be frank my Shaikh, this discussion is going nowhere: if one does not make his intention and mind pure he will never understand.

Al-Albani: This is indeed a good advice. We live in an age where one of the fatal characters is spread, which is everyone liking his own opinion. Today everybody who reads a bit of Quran or learns a bit of Ahkam and Ahadith, he thinks he is something in 3ilm although he cannot read the hadiths without errors, and then he wants to argue everything he sees ...

Al-jihad supporter... trying to interrupt...

Al-Albani: the time for discussion is over. I will take the advice of the brother. My advice to the students of knowledge is not proceed to preach to the people something that may lead them to great misguidance (Dalal). He should check with the people of knowledge before he jumps to conclusion. It is one of the disasters of the Muslim youth today to quickly adopt opinions without looking into the opinions of the Salaf and khalaf regards these issues. I advise Muslims to research this especially in the issues that concern the group such as jihad. Jihaad is, without doubt the the pride of Islam and of the basis of Islam (arkan) and the verses and Ahadith regards this are known to everybody insha' Allah. But this jihad has its conditions and introductions. From its basic conditions that the group that does it must be in agreement to return to Quran and Sunnah in their rulings (ahkam). This in fact needs a great time of education, purification and of scholars and preachers, like the Prophet ﷺ educated his companions. We notice that Mujahids call for whatever of the Muslims to join in the fight, and when they go to fight they find disagreement among themselves in matters of their faith and the basics of Islam. How do these people get ready to go for Jihad when they are yet to understand what is obligatory on them of Aqeedah??!! This my brother, leads us to understand that Jihaad is not to be discussed, but we must discuss its introductions. The first introduction is, as we attest before Allah, the khalifa. Because if the amirs exist today and the bond I talked about (common understanding of Islam) does not exist among them then they will turn against one another and fight each other. They must be all for one methodology and one understanding. I therefore advise every Muslim to work by the Hadith of Ibn al-yaman, leave all the groups and stay by yourself. And this is not to mean to live in isolation, no it means

not to join one or another group. You can do yourself and all the Muslims good with your knowledge. This is a reminder and the reminder benefits the believers.

www.moinkhan.webnode.com